



**HealthWorkers
4all**



The workforce crisis in healthcare

Mobility/emigration/immigration

Dana Fărcășanu, CPSS
Adriana Galan, INSP

6 October 2015, Bucharest

Romania – a workforce provider country

- There is **no** functioning monitoring system for either internal or external health workforce mobility
- The only data in the system estimating the phenomenon of external migration (*intention to leave*) come from the **certificates of diploma equivalence** issued by the MoH and from the **current professional certificates** (certificates of good practice) for physicians issued by the Romanian College of Physicians
- The data sources offer **fragmentary and sometimes inconsistent information**:
 - MoH: total number of physicians(2013) → 54.086
 - WHO/HFA database: total number of physicians(2013) → 52.828
 - Eurostat: total number of physicians(2013) → 52.828

Sources and types of existing data

- MoH through the National Centre for Statistics and Informatics in Public Health (national registry of physicians and dentists and the number of requests for the certificates of diploma equivalence)
- Romanian College of Physicians (national registry of practicing physicians)
- Romanian College of Dentists (national registry of practicing dentists)
- Order of Nurses, Midwives and Medical Assistants in Romania (national registry of nurses and midwives)
- National Institute of Statistics (workforce survey)

The situation of physicians(1)

The rate of external migration of Romanian physicians 2007-2015

Year	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015 (sem I)
Nr. physicians*	45707	47617	47617	48484	50778	51153	52362	na	na
Nr. Professional certificates**	na	1155	1401	2879	2981	2460	2195	1984	1219

Data on internal migration are virtually non-existent

Data on external migration are extremely scarce and of low quality

Data on immigration are not public

- **16.274** requests for Professional Certificates registered at the Romanian College of Physicians (2008-2015 1th semester)
- **26.917** requests for Certificates of Conformity for physicians, dentists and pharmacists, registered at the Ministry of Health, in the 2007-2012 timeframe***

Source:

* Eurostat (<http://appsso.eurostat.ec.europa.eu>)

** Romanian College of Physicians

*** Assoc. Prof. Dr. Diana Păun, State Advisor (October 2015)

The situation of physicians(2)

- France, Germany, Great Britain seem to be the preferred destination countries and they have active recruitment policies for Romania. The most sought-after medical specialties are family medicine, intensive care and psychiatry.
- A study from 2005 conducted by the MoH on the topic of physicians' external migration showed that an estimated **360 physicians** left Romania to work abroad in **2004**.
- The Romanian College of Physicians conducted a study in 2008 to assess the phenomenon of physicians' external migration. The data show that around 3% (1421) out of the total number of physicians had left Romania in 2007.
- According to the Presidential Administration/ the Department for Public Health, there are **10.692 Romanian physicians registered as practicing physicians in 6 European countries** in 2015.
- If we compare the numbers from 2004 (360 physicians), 2007 (1421 physicians) and 2015 (10 692 physicians), the increasing trend of physicians' migration after joining the European Union becomes clear

The situation of nurses

- As of January 2007, the MoH is issuing a certificate for diploma recognition for nurses and midwives on request
 - in 2007 → 2896 requests
 - in 2008 → 1977 requests
 - in 2009 (January-April) → 612 requests
- The extent of the external migration of nurses is virtually unknown (not all EU member states require a certificate of diploma recognition)
- A study conducted by the MoH in 2004 showed that an estimated 1.652 nurses chose to work abroad.
- According to OAMGMAMR, more than 20.000 nurses have requested professional certificates by 31 December 2014.

The situation of medical staff immigration

Official data on foreign physicians working in Romania are not public.

Over the past 3-4 years a new phenomenon has emerged in the Romanian healthcare system: the presence of foreign physicians on the labour market :

- temporary migration along the border (with Bulgaria and Hungary)
- permanent migration (for instance, the physicians from the Republic of Moldova that are settled in Romania- their numbers are steadily dropping since Romania joined the EU).

Approx. 1110 foreign physicians registered in Romania, of which 500 come from the Republic of Moldova

Policies targeting the mobility of healthcare professionals

- The MoH does **not** currently have a public policy document in the area of human resources for health
- Planning is currently based on a relatively stable number of employment positions in the public sector
- All legislation issued in the past years for the regulation of the medical professions were governed by the requirements of harmonisation with EU regulations for the mutual recognition of diplomas. The measures taken in the public sector were mainly concerned with education programmes and programmes for modernizing training facilities

Conclusions

- External migration and imbalances in the distribution of health workforce are critical issues for Romanian policy makers as a result of:
 - Joining the EU
 - The economic crisis
 - The inadequate planning and management in the area of human resources for health
- The data sources must be integrated and harmonized with the ones at the EU level
- It is necessary for the MoH to implement a systematic evidence-based planning process for human resources for health and adequately manage the complex and critical issue of retaining qualified healthcare staff through short, medium and long-term measures ***By implementing the measures outlined in the National Strategy for Health 2014-2020***

National Strategy for Health 2014-2020

O.S.5.2. The implementation of a sustainable policy for ensuring human resources for health

“A well trained and motivated staff is an essential prerequisite to ensuring the provision of quality services. In the past years there has been a trend of migration of healthcare staff to other countries, because of the attractiveness of better working conditions, pay and professional recognition. The sustainability of human resources for health can be ensured through retention policies that would consist of providing financial incentives and improving perspectives for professional development of healthcare staff. In addition, incentives for those practicing in underserved areas or neglected specialties would be necessary, and the training capacity would have to be adequate to the healthcare system’s need for professionals.”

National Strategy for Health 2014-2020

Strategic courses of action/Measures

1. The development of the strategic and normative framework for the optimisation of human resources for health, both in the area of clinical services and that of public health
 - **Situation analysis** of healthcare (current stock, deficit, prognoses of need-differentiated territorially and according to staff categories)
 - Defining a **strategy/ human resources development plan**, in cooperation with the relevant agencies
 - **Identifying sustainable measures for attracting and retaining** physicians and nurses in the neglected specialties and geographic areas, such as:
 - organizing the residency based on available vacancies and the provision of facilities by local communities
 - providing some facilities for the creation of family medicine offices, to physicians who work in the outpatient clinic and to multipurpose centres, including the reduction of royalties to a reasonable amount and co-payment for utilities
 - providing additional incentives to open medical offices in underserved areas

National Strategy for Health 2014-2020

Strategic courses of action/Measures

- Human resources policy that would ensure the employment, retention and **professional development** of staff in public health institutions, including for those graduating from the public health and health management residency and other professionals
- Developing **unitary criteria for the regulation, quality, equipping, evaluation and monitoring** of staff activity, continuing education/training of technical staff and decision-makers, the use of ICT instruments and an improved regulatory framework
- **revising the wage system in the direction of flexibility and incentivising performance and competitiveness** by excluding healthcare professionals (physicians, nurses, midwives) from the category of civil servants

National Strategy for Health 2014-2020

Strategic courses of action/Measures

2. Ensuring the training of an adequate number of staff- primarily in neglected clinical specialties (*) and public health- to meet the needs for staff in high-priority healthcare areas

- **Reforming residency programmes** in the areas of admission, training and obtaining a specialist physician qualification, obtaining the certificates of additional studies for specialist physicians in adult or paediatric medicine
- Including **new specialties/qualifications in the basic training of nurses**, according to the needs
- Organizing interventions/ specific training programmes for the **continuing education** of healthcare workers, including through e-learning solutions

() anesthesiology-intensive care, neurosurgery, paediatric surgery, cardiovascular surgery, vascular surgery, radioterapy, psychiatry- including paediatric psychiatry*